ANNOTATION

of the dissertation of Bazarbayeva A.B. on the topic «Probation control: problems of theory, legislation and practice», prepared for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 6D030300 – «Law enforcement»

The dissertation research is related to a detailed analysis of the existing legislative and law enforcement practice in matters of implementing probation control as an independent form of probation in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The study was conducted against the background of relative stabilization of regulatory issues, but with the preservation of certain contradictory and inconsistent aspects that prevent the recognition of the existing mechanism of probation control as an effective and sufficient resource for corrective influence on persons in respect of whom it is established. At the same time, further development of legislation and practice in matters of implementing probation control leads both to periodic changes requiring the achievement of organic unity of regulatory material, and to the need to search for additional resources and tools that meet the dynamics of social relations and the needs of penal practice.

Relevance of the research topic. The socio-economic and political-legal transformations intensively carried out in Kazakhstan allow us to conclude that the place and role of the state and citizen in modern society are changing. Along with solving many issues of society's life, this implies mandatory updating and improvement of legislation, including that aimed at combating crime, curbing the risks of repeated forms of criminal behavior, without which achieving the necessary level of citizen security is impossible. This necessitates constant analysis, revision and improvement of the existing mechanisms of criminal-executive influence in relation to persons who have committed criminal offenses.

By now, the recognition of deprivation of liberty as an extremely contradictory nature has been established as a social and legal axiom, which requires its exclusively measured use and only in cases where the correction of a person without physical isolation is not possible. On the one hand, the positive aspects of deprivation of liberty are the neutralization of the possibility of a person committing new criminal offenses, the destruction of ties with the antisocial environment, the creation of conditions for the implementation of targeted punitive and educational influence, etc. On the other hand, the isolation of a convicted person carries negative consequences in the form of lost socially useful ties, the institutionalization of the individual in conditions of lack of freedom, for the formation of which, as special conditions show, 5-7 years of isolation are sufficient.

It is precisely in order to overcome the corresponding negative phenomena, to reduce the number of people placed in the penitentiary society, that over the past decades, a tendency has been expressed all over the world to orient national penal practices to the maximum extent possible to use all possible resources to reduce the number of people placed in conditions of physical isolation. Over a relatively long period, Kazakhstan demonstrated favorable indicators, expressed in an annual

decrease in the "prison population index". At the same time, according to data provided by international organizations, by 2024 Kazakhstan will have a prison population index of 184 (i.e. 184 people per 100 thousand of the population). At the same time, the total number of people sentenced to imprisonment by 2024 is 35,228 thousand people, of which only 7% are women. By mid-2024, Kazakhstani information resources indicated a figure of 37 thousand convicts held in places of deprivation of liberty, and noted an increase in the number of convicts of the corresponding category by 7 thousand over the past 4 years. However, this is explained not so much by the worsening of the crime situation in the country, but by the fact that in recent years there has been a tightening of criminal legislation on so-called common crimes.

At the same time, the instability of the criminological situation in the country requires constant attention, and the reverse growth of the prison population may indicate, among other things, the insufficient effectiveness of probation measures. At the same time, «probation» (from the English «probation» - «test») is usually understood as such sanctions and measures of a criminal-legal nature, when a convicted person is placed on probation, established by the court, under the supervision of special bodies, with the possibility of applying a number of different restrictions to him. In fact, probation in all forms of its implementation is currently assessed as an achievement of modern social and legal practices, since it embodies such principles as humanism, economy of measures of criminal-legal repression, the prevalence of prevention over punishment, etc. The probation institute was actually announced in the Republic of Kazakhstan with the adoption of the Concept of Legal Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the period from 2010 to 2020, which, in particular, noted that «... for more active application by courts of measures alternative to imprisonment, it is necessary to achieve an increase in the efficiency of their implementation, which requires the institutional development of a specialized body responsible for the implementation of such measures». The Concept of Legal Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030 places greater emphasis on issues of the quality of probation activities: increasing the status of probation officers; changing approaches to assessing the effectiveness of postpenitentiary probation, deepening the interaction of probation subjects, etc.

Unlike the probation institution itself, probation control has not become a fundamentally new practice, since in the previous organization of criminal-executive influence similar mechanisms were applied to conditionally sentenced persons. It was on the institution of conditional sentence that the projection of probation control was first applied in connection with the adoption of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 556-IV of February 15, 2012. Later, with the adoption in 2014 of the new Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Criminal Executive Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the institution of probation control was expanded to several categories of persons and had a tendency to further expansion, and mechanisms appeared for combining control activities with elements of social and legal assistance. The final stage in the formation of the national probation institution was the adoption in 2016 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On

Probation», which systematized the main issues related to the relevant activities, specified its subjects, defined the forms, goals, principles, etc.

At the same time, the «probation population» is currently decreasing proportionally in relation to the number of the «prison population». Thus, at the end of the 3rd quarter of 2024, the total number of persons registered with the probation service was 28,205 people; while the number of convicts in places of deprivation of liberty was 41,515 people. In 2020, 33,316 people were registered with the probation service; in 2021 - 30,989 people; in 2022 - 28,458 people; in 2023 - 29,062 people, which indicates that there is a clear downward trend against the background of an increase in the «prison population».

Moreover, the largest percentage of the «probation population» is made up of individuals who are subject to probation control. Thus, in 2020, restriction of freedom was imposed on 21,079 convicts; in 2021 - 21,358; in 2022 - 19,606; in 2023 - 20,582; in 2024 (as of October 1, 2024) - 19,644 convicts. The number of individuals to whom suspended sentences were applied is also quite high: in 2020 - 4,491 convicts; in 2021 - 3,862; in 2022 - 3,758; in 2023 - 3,547; in 2024 (as of October 1, 2024) - 3,328 convicts. A fairly numerous category is also represented by persons released on parole from places of imprisonment, for whom probation control is carried out by the Internal Affairs Directorate (Local police service). Thus, in 2020 there were 4,748 of them; in 2021 - 4,587; in 2022 - 4,241; in 2023 - 4,111 people.

Only a balanced mechanism of probationary control can guarantee more or less positive results, for which it must be, on the one hand, unified, on the other – flexible and targeted. Despite the fact that the abolition of probationary control in individual cases cannot be an automatic evidence of the ineffectiveness of this measure, nevertheless, its mechanism requires a deep study on the sufficiency of the control and punitive impact, the flexibility of the applied means of influence, the degree of individualization in relation to specific persons who have committed criminal offenses, etc. These circumstances are the evidence of the relevance of the study of probationary control as an independent institution of criminal-executive law, which in its essence constitutes a significant social and legal practice in the structure of combating crime in the country.

The purpose and objectives of the study. The purpose of the dissertation research is a comprehensive analysis of theoretical and practical problems related to the issues of regulatory consolidation and the mechanism for implementing probation control as one of the forms of probation in the context of the modern criminal and penal policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the development of proposals to improve the legislative regulation of this institution in order to streamline law enforcement practice, as well as its further development.

In accordance with the specified goal, the following **tasks** were set and solved during the dissertation research:

- to study the historical stages of the emergence and development of probation control in the legislation and practice of foreign states;
- to analyze the legal regulation of the application and organization of probation control in certain foreign countries;

- to assess the historical stages of the formation of the institution of probation control in the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- to study the essence, goals and principles of probation control under the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- to analyze the subjective composition of criminal-executive relations within the framework of probation control in the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- to study the content of probation control as a form of probation in the Republic of Kazakhstan; carry out a comprehensive analysis of the organizational and legal aspects of the implementation of probation control by the probation service; assess the specifics of the organizational and legal aspects of the implementation of probation control by the police.

Methodology and methods of the research. The dialectical method of cognition of social phenomena was chosen as the fundamental research method, which made it possible to assess the socio-legal essence and significance of the probation control institution based on taking into account regularities and contradictions. The following were used in the structure of general scientific methods of cognition: inductive-deductive (in particular, on issues of assessing the means of unification, differentiation and individualization of probationary impact); the method of analysis and synthesis (in the analysis of individual elements of probationary control, united within the framework of a single institution); the modeling method (in the course of justifying the necessary changes to the current legislation). The set of specific scientific methods included: historical and legal; comparative legal; sociological; statistical; structural and functional (in the course of analyzing the sufficiency of existing regulatory structures for the successful implementation of probationary control by its subjects); formal and logical (in assessing the consistency of legislative provisions, including with the norms of other branches of Kazakhstani law); content analysis of theoretical sources, publications in the media and available information and communication resources (in particular, when assessing the problem of using electronic means of monitoring convicts, obtaining data from international assessments, etc.), etc.

The scientific novelty of the study is due to the fact that it contains a reassessment of individual regulatory and law enforcement aspects that have developed to date in matters of appointment and implementation of probation control. By means of a constructive and critical analysis, individual issues of excessive unification of the probation control mechanism, insufficient completion of duties imposed on persons in respect of whom it is established, the absence of flexible and differentiated mechanisms of influence on individual categories of convicts within the framework of probation control, etc. are identified. A number of specific proposals for stabilization of the regulatory material and its further development are substantiated, as well as recommendations related to available methods of optimization of law enforcement practice of the probation service and the Local police service in matters of implementation of the relevant control functions.

The novelty of the conducted dissertation research is mainly reflected in the following main provisions submitted for defense:

- 1. Probation control as an independent form of probation has become the most successful element of replicating advanced foreign practices due to the initial presence in the national system of similar elements of criminal-executive influence implemented in relation to conditionally sentenced persons, which contributed to its successful legal acculturation, in contrast to other forms of probation influence, as well as consolidation within the framework of sentencing and post-penitentiary probation. At the same time, it is necessary to streamline the regulatory material, which to date retains a significant number of contradictions, including within the framework of the main definitive constructions, by:
- following the requirements of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On legal acts» (clause 1 of Article 25), clause 2 of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On probation» must be set out as follows: «Probation control is the activity of authorized bodies to exercise control over the performance by persons registered with them of the duties imposed on them by law and the court».
- bringing the definition of the concept of «probation control» in paragraph 2 of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On Probation» in line with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Article 3 of the Criminal Executive Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan (in order to comply with the principle of hierarchy of regulatory legal acts);
- additions to Part 1 of Article 19 of the Criminal Executive Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the definition of probation in paragraph 2 of Article 12 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On Probation» with an indication of the establishment of probation control in relation to an additional category of persons whose punishment in the form of a fine, correctional labor or community service was replaced by restriction of freedom (*in order to take into account the relevant legislative changes*);
- amendments to subparagraph 8 of Article 3 of the Criminal Executive Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan and paragraph 1 of Article 9 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On Probation» with authentic definitions of the following content: «the probation service is a body of the penal system that exercises executive and administrative functions to ensure the execution of criminal penalties without isolation from society and other measures of criminal-legal influence, as well as to organize and operate probation» (in order to simultaneously eliminate the redundancy and insufficiency of the features used).
- 2. The result of the analysis of the object of probationary influence, which is the transformed legal status of persons under probationary control, is the conclusion on the need to supplement the list of obligations listed in Part 2 of Article 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan:
- in addition to establishing a general obligation to undergo treatment for addiction to psychoactive substances (for all persons), establish a ban on the use of psychoactive substances in relation to persons who have committed a criminal offense due to the *harmful* use of these substances, not related to the presence of addiction;
- include an obligation corresponding to the ban on the use of psychoactive substances and consisting in establishing a requirement for periodic examination,

with recognition of the refusal of such examination as evasion of probationary control;

- the obligation of the convicted person related to undergoing treatment must be supplemented by an indication of «socially significant diseases, the list of which is established by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan» (HIV, tuberculosis, viral hepatitis);
- include an additional obligation to undergo treatment and medical and social rehabilitation from gambling addiction (as an additional measure within the framework of the Comprehensive Plan to Combat Illegal Gambling Business and Gambling Addiction in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2024-2026);
- Part 2 of Article 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan shall be supplemented with the following wording: «In the event that special requirements for behavior are established in relation to the convicted person in accordance with Article 98-3 of this Code, the corresponding restrictions shall be included in the content of the duties determined by the court when establishing probationary control».
- 3. Taking into account the experience of advanced foreign practices, as well as the failed legislative practice of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the past, the expediency of ranking probation control into regular and enhanced through the following changes is substantiated: 1) inclusion of forced labor in all types of probation control implemented by the probation service and the Local police service (except for those persons to whom its application is impermissible in accordance with Part 1 of Article 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan); 2) establishment of a greater volume of forced labor within the framework of enhanced probation control (150 hours per year); 3) application of enhanced probation control for a period established by the court (at least 6 months) shall be extended to persons who have committed violations while serving a restriction of freedom; conditionally sentenced for serious crimes; conditionally released from imprisonment for serious and especially serious crimes.
- 4. It is substantiated that the current practice of establishing and implementing punishments for military personnel who have committed criminal offenses does not meet the modern needs of the state in ensuring the defense capability and stability of the personnel of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as a result of which it is necessary:
- to reduce the imperativeness of the provisions of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 561-IV of February 16, 2012 «On military service and the status of military personnel» in matters of dismissal of convicted persons for negative reasons by changing the existing wording as follows: «the entry into force of a guilty verdict of the court for committing a serious or especially serious crime, as well as the imposition of a punishment in the form of restriction of freedom or actual imprisonment»;
- to recognize the command of military units as subjects of probationary control in relation to conditionally sentenced military personnel (reconstruction of the previously existing mechanism within the framework of Article 181 of the

Criminal Executive Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan of 1997, taking into account the needs of modern practice).

- 5. In order to more effectively implement the principle of stimulating lawabiding and socially useful behavior of convicted persons, a proposal is justified to supplement Article 64 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan with a provision of the following content: *«A suspended sentence may be revoked upon expiration of one third of the established term if the convicted person has carried out volunteer activities during the year in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as in the event of his participation in the elimination of the consequences of natural disasters, environmental, man-made and other catastrophes, as well as providing assistance to persons affected by them. At the same time, the period of probationary supervision at the time of consideration of the issue of its cancellation by the court cannot be less than one year» (Article 72 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan should be supplemented with an authentic version with a proportional reduction in the terms of the actually served punishment in the form of restriction of freedom).*
- 6. Due to the pronounced homogeneity of such compulsory educational measures as «probationary control» and «restriction of leisure and establishment of special requirements for the behavior of minors», combine them within the framework of a single structure of probationary control through the following changes:
- updating the list of duties that may be imposed on minors released from criminal liability with the establishment of probationary control, by including prohibitions on the use of certain social networks and on communication with other minors or adults whose negative influence contributed to the commission of a criminal offense by a minor;
- additions 2) to Part 2 of Article 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan with a new paragraph of the following content: *«Convicted minors, taking into account the nature of the crime committed, their life situation and lifestyle, may also be imposed the duties stipulated by Part 7 of Article 85 of this Code»* (which should formulate the content of probationary control as a compulsory educational measure).
- 7. Taking into account the fact that the behavior of a person subject to probation control is predominantly assessed remotely, the remaining shortage of electronic surveillance tools can be successfully compensated for by developing and implementing into practice a targeted *mobile application* equipped with the function of automatic identification of the appearance and location of a person, carried out through random sampling, which will significantly reduce the physical and time costs of probation service employees and the Local police service.

Description of the main results of the study. The most significant results achieved during the study are as follows.

Result 1. In the course of the dissertation research, a comprehensive analysis of the concept of «probation control» as an independent form of probation was conducted. The author's vision of the definition of probation service, probation control is given.

Result 2. An analysis of the object of probationary influence, which is the transformed legal status of persons under probationary control, was conducted. The author substantiates the inadequacy of the list of duties listed in Part 2 of Article 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In this regard, it is proposed to supplement the above-mentioned article of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Result 3. The paper substantiates the advisability of ranking probation control into regular and enhanced, taking into account the experience of advanced foreign practices, as well as the failed legislative practice of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the past.

Result 4. The paper points out the insufficient explicitness of legal norms in relation to military personnel who have committed criminal offenses. In this regard, it is proposed to improve the norms of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 561-IV of February 16, 2012 «On Military Service and the Status of Military Personnel», as well as to recognize the command of military units as subjects of probation control in relation to conditionally sentenced military personnel.

Result 5. Based on the comparative legal analysis of domestic and foreign legislation regulating the application of probation control measures, proposals for improving domestic administrative legislation have been developed. The proposal to supplement Art. 64 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan is substantiated.

Result 6. As part of the conducted study, proposals were made to update the list of duties that may be imposed on minors released from criminal liability with the establishment of probationary control. In particular, it is proposed to supplement 2) part 2 of Article 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan with a new paragraph.

Result 7. Taking into account the fact of the predominantly remote assessment of the behavior of a person under probationary control and in order to significantly reduce the physical and time costs of probation service employees and the Local police service, it is proposed to introduce into practice a targeted mobile application equipped with the function of automatic identification of the appearance and location of a person, carried out through random sampling.

Justification of the novelty and importance of the obtained results.

The scientific novelty of the dissertation research is characterized by obtaining new significant results. The degree of novelty of scientific findings and conclusions is determined by the author's approach to the research problematic.

Result 1 is new, since the dissertation author, based on the study of the theoretical framework and the comprehensive analysis, concluded that due to the initial presence in the national system of similar elements of penal enforcement implemented in relation to conditionally sentenced persons. In this regard, the author points out the need to streamline the regulatory material, which still retains a significant number of contradictions, by providing a definition of the concept of «probation control», as well as changing the definition of sentencing probation in

paragraph 2 of Article 12 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On Probation» and «probation service» in its new wording.

Result 2 is new, since the compensatory potential of Part 2 of Article 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan is insufficient. In this regard, the author proposes to supplement Article 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan with a list of obligations. In particular, it is proposed to establish a ban on the use of psychoactive substances in relation to persons who committed a criminal offense due to the harmful use of these substances, not related to the presence of addiction; to include an obligation corresponding to the ban on the use of psychoactive substances and consisting in establishing a requirement for periodic examination, with recognition of the refusal of such examination as evasion of probation control; to supplement the obligation of the convicted person associated with undergoing treatment, indicating «socially significant diseases, the list of which is established by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan»; include an additional obligation to undergo treatment and medical and social rehabilitation for gambling addiction (as an additional measure within the framework of the Comprehensive Plan to Combat Illegal Gambling Business and Gambling Addiction in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2024-2026).

Result 3 is new, since in the context of assessing the current norms of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, it is possible to state an insufficient level of development of types of probationary control as a measure of criminal-legal influence.

Result 4 is new, since it formulates proposals for improving the norms of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 561-IV of February 16, 2012 «On military service and the status of military personnel», as well as recognition of the command of military units as subjects of probationary control in relation to conditionally sentenced military personnel.

Result 5 is new, since on the basis of the comparative legal analysis of domestic and foreign legislation regulating the application of probationary control measures, proposals for improving domestic administrative legislation have been developed. The proposal to supplement Art. 64 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan is substantiated.

The novelty of result 6 is determined by the fact that the author proposes a legislative correction within the framework of the conducted research, proposals were formed to update the list of duties that can be imposed on minors released from criminal liability with the establishment of probation control. In particular, it is proposed to supplement 2) part 2 of Art. 44 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan with a new paragraph.

Result 7 is new, since it substantiates the need to introduce into practice a targeted mobile application equipped with the function of automatic identification of the appearance and location of a person, carried out through random sampling, in order to significantly reduce the physical and time costs of probation service employees and the Local police service.

The topic of the dissertation research corresponds to state programs. The dissertation research was carried out in accordance with program documents of both international and national significance. The work takes into account the continuity of long-term programs for the development of the legal policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, accordingly, the provisions of the «Concept of Legal Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the period from 2010 to 2020» approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 24, 2009 and the «Concept of Legal Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030» approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 15, 2021 No. 674 «Concept of Legal Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030» are used, to a greater extent, the emphasis is placed on the issues of the quality of probation activities: increasing the status of probation officers; changing

approaches to assessing the effectiveness of post-penitentiary probation, deepening

the interaction of probation entities, etc.

Also, the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 26, 2021 No. 522 "The Concept of Development of Public Administration in the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030: Building a «humancentric model» - «People First», the dominant idea of which is to create mechanisms for a much deeper «humanization» of the public administration system. The structure of the study establishes the relationship between the issues under study and program documents directly related to the activities of law enforcement agencies on the application of probation control in relation to military personnel, in particular, with the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 29, 2017 No. 554, according to which the Military Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan was approved. Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 31, 2024 No. 432 «On approval of the Comprehensive Plan to combat illegal gambling business and ludomania in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2024-2026», related to the increase in the number of people susceptible to gambling addiction (ludomania) is one of the significant issues, which has also become very relevant in the Republic of Kazakhstan by now and which is directly related to criminal activity and other forms of destructive behavior (in particular, suicidal incidents).

The dissertation research correlates with industry program documents on the implementation and expansion of elements of digitalization of law enforcement activities, in particular, with the Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 24, 2024 No. 592 «On approval of the Concept for the development of artificial intelligence for 2024-2029», in view of the fact that digitalization can significantly optimize a number of areas of law enforcement activities, including in the context of probation control, which is mainly carried out in a distance mode.

A description of the applicant's contribution to the preparation of each publication.

The main results of the dissertation were published in 12 works, of which 1 article was published in the ranking journal JARLE-ASERS Publishing - Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics, included in the SCOPUS

database, 5 articles were published in publications recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Education and Science of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 6 publications were published in the materials of international scientific conferences.

All articles were prepared by the author alone:

- 1. Alibekova A.B. «Issues of implementing the resocializing function of probation control in the Republic of Kazakhstan» // JARLE-ASERS Publishing Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics (ISSN2068696X-Romania-Scopus), Volume VII, Winter), 7(21), p.1581-1587.
- 2. Alibekova A.B. «On some issues of the probation service in the Republic of Kazakhstan» // IV «Baltic Legal Forum «Law and Order in the Third Millennium»: Materials of the International Scientific and Practical Conference / edited by S.V. Veklenko. Kaliningrad Kaliningrad branch of the St. Petersburg University of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Russia, 2016. P. 184-185 (238 p.).
- 3. Alibekova A.B. «Features of the formation and development of the probation service in the Republic of Kazakhstan» // MES RK Academy «Bolashak». Materials of the international scientific and practical conference «Science and education in the modern world». Karaganda: RIO «Bolashak-Baspa» 2016. 1 volume. Pp. 13-15. (380 p.).
- 4. Alibekova A.B. «Probation control as an element of the system of execution of punishments not related to deprivation of liberty» // Improving the system of selection and training of police officers in light of the Plan of the Nation: Proc. int. scientific and practical. conf., dedicated to the memory of professor Kulzhakaeva Roza Balbatyrovna / Under the general editorship of Cand. of Law. Sciences D.T. Kenzhetaev. Karaganda: Karaganda Academy of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan named after B. Beisenov, 2016. Pp. 33-36. (386 p.).
- 5. Alibekova A.B. «On the issue of probation control as a type of control and support activities for the execution of punishments not related to isolation from society» // 25 years of Independence of the Republic of Kazakhstan: results and prospects: Proc. int. scientific and practical. conf., dedicated to. 25th anniversary of Independence of the Republic of Kazakhstan and 45th anniversary of the educational institution, September 23, 2016 Kostanay Academy of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan named after Shrakbek Kabylbaev, 2016. Pp. 245-248 (400 p.).
- 6. Alibekova A.B. «Some problems of the probation service of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the implementation of preventive activities in relation to registered persons» // Actual issues of modern science: Materials of the international. scientific and theoretical. conf., dedicated to the Address of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N.A. Nazarbayev to the people of Kazakhstan «The third modernization of Kazakhstan: global competitiveness» (April 7, 2017). Aktobe: University of Law of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of

- the Republic of Kazakhstan named after M. Bukenbaeva Kazakhstan Republics IIM M.Bokenbaev atyndagy Aktobe zan institutes, 2017. P. 21-23. (418 pp.).
- 7. Bazarbayeva A.B. «On the issue of international legal foundations of the probation service activities» // Proceedings of the international scientific and practical conference «Science and education in the modern world». Karaganda: RIO «Bolashak-Baspa» 2018.- 1 volume. Pp. 17-20. (379 p.).
- 8. Alibekova A.B. «Actual problems of interaction of the probation service with state and public institutions» // International popular science journal «Kazakhstannyn gylymy men omeri science and life of Kazakhstan». № 5 (40) 2016. Pp. 31-33. (317 p.) (recommended by the KOKSON MNiVO RK).
- 9. Alibekova A.B. «Current issues of organizing the activities of the probation service in the Republic of Kazakhstan» // International popular science journal «Kazakhstan's Science and Life Science and Life of Kazakhstan» № 1 (43) 2017. P. 226-228. (319 p.) (recommended by the Committee on Observance of the Law of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan).
- 10. Alibekova A.B. «Probation control as a functional element of the modern criminal-executive policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan» // Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi «Bulletin of KazNU» Legal series. № 1 (81) 2017. P. 333-335. (418 p.) (recommended by the Committee on Preventive Services of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan).
- 11. Alibekova A.B. «On some legal and organizational aspects of the probation service in the Republic of Kazakhstan» // International scientific journal «Gylym-Science». Kostanay Academy of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan named after Shrakbek Kabylbayev. № 2 (53) 2017, June. P. 136-140. (150 p.) (recommended by the Committee on Preventive Services of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan).
- 12. Alibekova A.B. «Organizational aspects of the functioning of the probation service in the Republic of Kazakhstan» // International popular science journal «Kazakhstan's history science and life of Kazakhstan» № 6 (66) 2018. P. 26-28. (218 p.) (recommended by the Committee on Observance of the Constitutional Court of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan).